

Entitlement Failures in Pakistan (1950-1971): A Tale of Disparity and Struggle for Justice

Ahmed Javed Chowdhury*

All knowledge is knowledge through concepts. - Socrates¹

Abstract

The 1971 genocide in Pakistan, resulting in the extermination of Bengalis, is a stark example of entitlement failure—where the state failed to protect its people’s rights and well-being. This essay explores economist Amartya Sen’s entitlement concept, which combines economics and political science to analyse this tragedy. Entitlement is about the resources available to individuals and households in a nation for a dignified life, emphasising the state’s role in upholding legal norms and empowering citizens. It includes primary (like education and health) and secondary entitlements (property rights and political participation), impacting social and economic disparities. The East-West disparity in Pakistan originated in 1947, with most Bengali Muslims supporting its creation. However, the dominance of non-Bengali Muslims and the imposition of Urdu as the sole national language led to discontent. Entitlement failure was evident in unequal resource allocation, favouring West Pakistan. The under-representation of Bengalis worsened the divide. Geographical separation, about 1200 miles apart, exacerbated this disconnection. Professor Nurul Islam’s 1950s observations highlighted East Pakistan’s slow development and inadequate investment. Foreign aid favoured the West, leaving East Pakistan

* Independent academic & Researcher; Assistant Professor, Department of Economics, City University, Dhaka, Bangladesh.

¹ Hasan Azizul Huq. (2013). Chapter-4. In Socrates (p. 59). Ittadi Grantho Prokash.

economically deprived; disparities extended to job placements, government spending, and basic commodity costs. In conclusion, entitlement failures in primary and secondary entitlements fuelled discontent among Bengalis. This inequality culminated in the 1971 War of Liberation, leading to Bangladesh's independence. It underscores the importance of equitable resource allocation and protecting entitlements for a just society.

Historical analyses, particularly those concerning Bangladesh, often fall into two distinct categories: the superstructure and the base structure. The superstructure encompasses many factors, including language, culture, identity, violence, colonial experiences, values, norms, policy matters, and political decisions. In contrast, the base structure delves into economic aspects such as disparities, exploitation, wealth redistribution, GDP, per capita income, and the ability to afford essentials for a decent life. However, the reality we face is far more intricate, with these two threads intricately woven together. In this forthcoming paper, I have made a concerted effort to integrate both facets of life seamlessly. I firmly believe that attempting to segregate these structures is an exercise in futility, as they are inherently interconnected. To achieve this holistic perspective, I have adopted Amartya Sen's entitlement approach as the guiding framework for my analysis. Through this approach, I aim to provide a comprehensive examination that not only bridges the gap between the superstructure and the base structure but also underscores their interdependence. I aim to present a unified understanding of these vital aspects of life, enriching our comprehension of Bangladesh's historical narrative.

The Entitlement Approach

The genocide that occurred in Pakistan in early 1971, which resulted in the widespread extermination of Bengalis, can be viewed as an entitlement failure, a tragic manifestation of the profound failure to ensure the rights and well-being of its people. This catastrophic event can be further understood through the insightful perspective of the visionary economist and philosopher Amartya Sen, who introduces the concept of entitlement. Sen's framework draws upon the convergence of two crucial branches of social science, namely economics and political science, to elucidate the complex dynamics at play.

As elucidated by Sen, Entitlement is the total of a nation's resources that empowers a household to secure and sustain life and liberty by accessing essential goods, services, and amenities. This notion underscores the imperative role of a state in not just upholding legal norms and practices but also in facilitating its citizens with the practical means to lead dignified lives within these parameters. It is an individual's entitlement that represents the array of diverse commodity combinations attainable through legitimate channels of acquisition available to

someone in their particular circumstances. Sen articulates this concept by stating, “The entitlement of a person stands for the different alternative commodity bundles that the person can acquire through the use of the various legal channels of acquirement open to someone in his position. In a private ownership market economy, the entitlement set of a person is determined by his original bundle of ownership (what is called his [or her] ‘endowment’) and the various alternative bundles he can acquire starting respectively from each initial endowment, through the use of trade and production (what is called his ‘exchange entitlement mapping’).”²

Amartya Sen contributed significantly to our understanding of entitlements. According to Sen, an entitlement is an individual’s claim to a set of resources, goods, or services. It is important to note that entitlements are not necessarily based on legal rights but on social norms and expectations. Sen’s concept of entitlement is rooted in the idea of freedom, particularly the notion that individuals should have the freedom to pursue their own goals and aspirations. He argues that entitlements are essential to exercising this freedom, as they provide individuals with the necessary resources to pursue their goals.

Sen distinguishes between two types of entitlements: primary and secondary. Primary entitlements are those that are directly related to an individual’s abilities, such as education, health, and nutrition. Secondary entitlements, on the other hand, are those that are related to an individual’s position in society, such as property rights, political rights, and social status. Sen argues that a society’s distribution of entitlements can have significant implications for its overall well-being and development. For example, if a society fails to provide basic education and health care to all of its citizens, it may limit their ability to participate fully in the economy and society, leading to social and economic inequality. This was precisely what happened in East Pakistan, partly due to the rulers of West Pakistan. Overall, Sen’s concept of entitlement emphasises the importance of ensuring that all individuals have access to the resources they need to pursue their goals and live fulfilling lives. By focusing on the distribution of entitlements, we can work towards creating a more just and equitable society.

Moreover, he has categorised four types of entitlement relations in his book *Poverty and Famines: An Essay on Entitlement and Deprivation*, published four decades ago, in the early 80s of the last century. He explains:

“Entitlement relations accepted in a private ownership market economy typically include the following, among others: (1) trade-based entitlement: one is entitled to own what one obtains by trading something one owns with a willing party

2 Dreze, J., Sen, A. & Hussain, A. (Eds.). (1995). *The Political Economy of Hunger: Selected Essays (WIDER Studies in Development Economics)*. (pp. 52-53). Oxford University Press.

(or, multilaterally, with a willing set of parties); (2) production-based entitlement, one is entitled to own what one gets by arranging production using one's owned resources, or resources hired from willing parties meeting the agreed conditions of trade; (3) own-labour entitlement: one is entitled to one's labour power, and thus to the trade-based and production-based entitlements related to one's labor power; (4) inheritance and transfer entitlement: one is entitled to own what is willingly given to one by another who legitimately owns it, possibly to take effect after the latter's death (if so specified by him)."³

In essence, Sen's concept of entitlement offers a profound lens through which we can analyse the tragic events of the Bengali genocide in 1971, emphasising the failure of the state to safeguard the entitlements of its people. This perspective highlights the critical importance of not just legal structures but also the practical empowerment of individuals and communities to lead secure and prosperous lives within the boundaries of a just and compassionate society. Regrettably, the state of Pakistan found itself unable to uphold equity and justice between its two distinct regions, namely the Eastern and Western parts. In addition to this, it imposed a heavy burden of state-centered injustices upon the Eastern region.

An Overview of Bengali Identity Formation

The root cause of disparity-based Pakistani policy-making occurred nearly eight decades ago. One of the highly regarded historians, A. F. Salahuddin Ahmed, traces this in this way, "During British rule, the great majority of the Muslims of India came under the spell of separatist Muslim nationalism for a variety of reasons. They seem to believe that their community's special interests and aspirations would be fulfilled if they could establish their own, separate state. This was the prime idea behind the Pakistan movement."⁴ Over time, we would not be able to find a sustainable state which is based on religious nationalism. The visionary poet-novelist Rabindranath Tagore showed this in his outstanding novel *Gora*. The protagonist of the novel, Gora, wants to be a 'pure Hindu' after a quite long journey of consciousness while interacting with his family and friends, constantly updates himself through social conscience and intellectual awareness from lower to upper stem, and finally reaches the culmination at the end of the novel: "'Mother, you are my mother!' exclaimed Gora. 'The mother whom I have been wondering about

3 Sen, A. (1999). Chapter 1: Poverty and Entitlements [Print]. In *Poverty and Famines: An Essay on Entitlement and Deprivation* (pp. 1–8). Oxford University Press (Oxford India Paperbacks). (Original work published 1981)

4 Ahmed, A. F. (2022). Introduction: Bangladesh History and Culture: An Overview [Print]. In A. F. Ahmed, B. M. Chowdhury, A. Khan, A. M. Chowdhury, & S. M. Shahed (Eds.), *An Introductory Reader: Bangladesh National Culture and Heritage*. ISBN 978 984 506 273 2 (2nd ed., pp. 4–5). The University Press Limited (UPL), Dhaka, Bangladesh.

in search of was all the time sitting in my room at home. You have no caste, you make no distinctions, and have no hatred- you are only the image of our welfare! It is you who are India!”⁵

What Rabindranath emphasised is that a country or a specific geographical boundary does not belong to any particular religion or ethnic community. Instead, it is a place of multi-religious and multi-ethnic communities that would maintain a harmonious relationship across groups and live peacefully. Unfortunately, cognitive development lagged, and superfluous opinion generators won over immature consciousness. This consciousness sprouts from the upper class of the Muslim society, which comprises non-Bengali Muslims and consists of migrants: Punjabis and Urdu-speaking people who came from India, particularly from Uttar Pradesh and Bihar.⁶ However, it is a fact that the Bengali Muslim community holds more than half of the Muslim population of India, who are primarily outspoken people. This Bengali Muslim cohort was a supporter of embarking on Pakistan from the Indian sub-continent with a different expectation from that of Punjabi and Urdu people. Moreover, caste prejudices, anti-Muslim sentiments, and communal attitudes of middle and upper-class Hindu *bhadralok* resulted in disharmony and conflicts in society. This counteractive effect on Muslims could be translated as anti-Hindu feelings.

What constituted the deep-rooted process of Bengali national identity formation was explained by historian Salahuddin Ahmed: “Compared to many modern nation-states, Bangladesh is young- but it is home to an old civilization. Geography and history have marked Bengal as a distinct region and Bengali-speaking people as a distinct community. This distinctness has been recognized since long ago.”⁷ Bengal has drawn invaders and immigrants from different parts of the world since ancient times because of its smooth river connectivity, unlike Africa, where lands and mountains disjoined waterways. Rabindranath himself emphasised this in his poems, song lyrics, and essays, including the aesthetic aspect. Before Tagore, the significance of the role of rivers in boosting trade and commerce was vigorously articulated by the father of modern economics, Adam Smith (1723- 1790). Amartya Sen explains, “The analysis of Adam Smith on the place of rivers in the development of the market economy. Smith saw Bengal in

5 *Gora : Rabindranath Tagore : Free download, Borrow, and streaming : Internet Archive.* (1949). Internet Archive. <https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.351175/page/n417/mode/2up?view=theater>

6 Ahmed, A. F. (2022). Introduction: Bangladesh History and Culture: An Overview [Print]. In A. F. Ahmed, B. M. Chowdhury, A. Khan, A. M. Chowdhury, & S. M. Shahed (Eds.), *An Introductory Reader: Bangladesh National Culture and Heritage*. ISBN 978 984 506 273 2 (2nd ed., p. 5). The University Press Limited (UPL), Dhaka, Bangladesh.

7 *Ibid*, p. 1.

the eighteenth century as very prosperous economically, which he linked not only to the skills of locally trained workers but also (very much) to the opportunities arising from rivers and navigation.”⁸ For instance, Smith pointed out the role of navigational opportunities that contributed to flourishing civilisations: Baltic and Adriatic seas in Europe, the Mediterranean and Euxine seas in both Europe and Asia, gulphs of Arabia, Persia, India, Bengal, and Siam in Asia,⁹ etc. Smith further extended his line of thoughts of explaining the Nile in the civilisation of northern Africa as a general pattern but pointed out the backwardness of Africa the absence of navigational opportunities: “the great rivers of Africa are at too great a distance from one another to give occasion to any considerable inland navigation.”¹⁰

This geographical pattern allows the Bengal mind to amalgamate with distant civilisations and facilitate a hybrid, flexible, and inclusive identity that non-Bengalis generally do not have. Salahuddin Ahmed contends, “It is generally believed that Islam came to Bengal long before the Muslim conquest of the region in the thirteenth century. Some Arab Muslim traders who had arrived in Bengal around the eighth and ninth centuries are believed to have established settlements in the coastal regions of Bengal, particularly in the areas of present-day Noakhali and Chittagong.”¹¹ He further adds that “It is commonly known that the inhabitants of Bengal have sprung from diverse racial backgrounds, including proto-Australoid, Mongoloid, Dravidian, Aryan, Arab, and Turko-Afghan. Besides these, another element came from East Africa. For several years, Bengal was ruled by a series of five or six Abyssinian Sultans, and there was also a practice of keeping Abyssinian guards for royal palaces. Traces of Abyssinian descent are still noticeable in the facial features of Bengali Hindus and Muslims.”¹²

From ancient to the present, Bengal was a mix of several human settlements of different clans such as “Banga or Vanga, Gauda, Pundra, or Rarha.”¹³ Bengal’s identity and psyche have always been a composite culture of harmonious co-existence, from the Vaishnava bhakti cult of Shri Chaitanya (1338-1553), Muslim Sufi saints to the translation of Mahabharata and Bhagavad Gita from Sanskrit to

8 Sen, A. (2021, July). The Rivers of Bengal [Print]. In *Home in the World: A Memoir* (p. 25). Allen Lane, an imprint of Penguin Books, Penguin Random House, UK. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00207233.2022.2043117>

9 *ibid.*

10 *ibid.* p. 26

11 Ahmed, A. F. (2022). Introduction: Bangladesh History and Culture: An Overview [Print]. In A. F. Ahmed, B. M. Chowdhury, A. Khan, A. M. Chowdhury, & S. M. Shahed (Eds.), *An Introductory Reader: Bangladesh National Culture and Heritage*. ISBN 978 984 506 273 2 (2nd ed., p. 2). The University Press Limited (UPL), Dhaka, Bangladesh.

12 *ibid.* p. 3.

13 *ibid.*

Bengali under Muslim Sultans. Therefore, the cultural heritage consists of three sources: “(a) the pre-Aryan and Hindu-Buddhist elements; (b) Islamic elements; and Western or European elements. Each has been inextricably woven into the cultural fabric of the region, contributing to its many-sided splendor.”¹⁴

Unravelling the Language Movement through the Lens of Entitlement Discourse

Two seemingly different identities, on the one hand, historically constitute the inclusive self of Bengali Muslims, and the less-flexible exclusive Punjabi-Urdu psyche came into confrontation immediately after the creation of Pakistan since non-Bengali Muslims captured the power and started to dominate Bengali Muslims. The birth of Pakistan would not be possible without the support of the majority Bengali Muslims. As a result of this, since the expectations of Bengali Muslims were not fulfilled, they began to worry about their future since they did not find much sign of fair treatment by the minority Panjabi-Urdu speaking community who perceived themselves as Ashraf (superior class). The composition of the population according to different languages was as follows: 1. Pashto: 7%, Balochi: 1.4%, 3. Sindhi: 5.8%, Punjabi: 28.4%, Anglo-Indian: 1.8%, Urdu: 7.2%, 7. Bangla: 54.6%.¹⁵

On 21st March 1948, in his convocation speech at Dhaka University, M. A. Jinnah, the founder of Pakistan and the first Governor-General, declared that “‘Urdu and Urdu alone’ would be the language of the state of Pakistan.”¹⁶ Moreover, he warned the large crowd at the Dhaka Race Course field: “He [Jinnah] sounded a warning against what he called the forces of subversion and conspiracy bent on destroying the unity of Pakistan.”¹⁷ This disrespectful speech ignited historic language movements led by Dhaka University students and staff and other conscious youths. Some months later, in the same year, on December 10, the United Nations (UN) adopted The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), where Article 2 explicitly expresses that every human being is entitled to language as the fundamental element, including other rights and freedoms.¹⁸ This may be the first entitlement failure of Pakistan’s citizens caused by the violation of language rights initiated by the central policy maker. It is also proof of the assertion of the exclusive Ashraf identity of the Urdu-speaking group.

14 *ibid.* p. 4.

15 Hossain, K. (2013, December 1). *Bangladesh: Quest for Freedom and Justice*. (pp. 6-9). Oxford University Press, USA.

16 Ahsan, S. B. (2020, March 4). When Mr Jinnah came to Dhaka. *Dhaka Tribune*. <https://www.dhakatribune.com/opinion/op-ed/202933/when-mr-jinnah-came-to-dhaka>

17 *ibid.*

18 United Nations. (10 December 1948). *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* | United Nations. <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/universal-declaration-of-human-rights>

Entitlement failure occurs when the fundamental rights of freedom of speech for individuals or communities are obstructed by the state's policy decisions, thereby preventing the alleviation of illiteracy. This is ultimately related to better job opportunities, which enhance one's capability and help reduce group inequality. It is worth considering whether employing an entitlement approach to address a historical event is already settled in the annals of history and offers any additional benefits. History, after all, remains open to interpretation. The endeavour to re-examine the underlying causes of the historic language movement, which ultimately gave birth to an independent nation, Bangladesh, is undertaken with a fresh perspective. Moreover, my perspective does not solely emphasise an exclusive new approach rooted in entitlement. Instead, I posit that it may complement other nationalist discourses that examine the language movement. By delving into the essence of the language movement, we may gain a deeper understanding of the sacrifices made, including bloodshed and loss of lives, in the pursuit of language rights.

The entitlement approach offers a distinct advantage over conventional analyses regarding shaping language rights within a state's central policy framework. It holds the promise of enabling less populous language-based groups to assert their rights. Besides the movements and other activism, Dhirendranath Datta stands out as the trailblazing advocate who championed the recognition of Bengali, complete with its traditional script, as an official state language in the Pakistan assembly.¹⁹ In today's global landscape, we are confronted with the existence of a staggering 7,106²⁰ living languages, alongside the somber fact that 573²¹ languages have already vanished from human discourse, with only a handful successfully revived. This underscores the profound impact of language movements, both historical and contemporary, in contributing to the enrichment and diversification of our world.

Entitlement Failures and Deprivations in East Pakistan

In the opening chapter of *A Theory of Justice*, John Rawls posed a breakthrough in the history of thoughts. He writes: "Justice is the first virtue of social institutions, as truth is of systems of thought."²² In explaining what justice is in his highly regarded book *A Theory of Justice*, published in the same year of 7th March Speech

19 Dhirendranath Datta's proposal. (2023). In *Bengali Language Movement*. Retrieved September 17, 2023, from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bengali_language_movement

20 Lingua. (2022, July 29). How many languages are there in the world? | *Lingua.edu*. <https://lingua.edu/how-many-languages-are-there-in-the-world/>

21 Sichel, B., & Sichel, B. (2019, November 6). Understanding extinct languages: when and why they die off - ILS Translations. *ILS Translations - Technical Translation Services*. <https://www.ilstranslations.com/blog/understanding-extinct-languages-when-and-why-they-die-off/>

22 Rawls, John. (1999). 1. The Role of Justice: Chapter I. Justice As Fairness [Print]. In *A Theory of Justice* (Revised, p. 3). The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press. (Original work published 1971)

and our great war of liberation when we embarked as an independent state, 1971, Rawls wrote:

“Each person possesses an inviolability founded on justice that even the welfare of society as a whole cannot override. For this reason, justice denies that the loss of freedom for some is made right by a greater good shared by others. It does not allow that the sacrifices imposed on a few are outweighed by the larger sum of advantages enjoyed by many. Therefore, in a just society, the liberties of equal citizenship are taken settled; the rights secured by justice are not subject to political bargaining or to the calculus of social interests. The only thing that permits us to acquiesce in an erroneous theory is the lack of a better one; analogously, an injustice is tolerable only when it is necessary to avoid an even greater injustice. Being the first virtues of human activities, truth and justice are uncompromising.”²³

Bangabandhu Sheikh Mujibur Rahman, the visionary politician, the founder of independent Bangladesh, the biggest influence on the lives of Bangladeshis, the most admired person in Bengal, Father of the Nation, and the first signatory of the Bangladesh Constitution in 1972, told in his historic “7th March Speech” (translated by Fakrul Alam) that,

“I’ve met President Yahya Khan. I’ve made a request to him not only on behalf of Bengal but also as the leader of the party which has the majority in Pakistan: I said to him: “You must hold the session of the National Assembly on 15 January.” But he did not listen to me. He listened to Mr. Bhutto instead. At first, he said that the meeting would take place in the first week of March. We said, “Fine, we will be taking our seats in the Assembly then.” I said we will carry out our discussions in the Assembly. I went so far as to say that if anyone came up with an offer that was just, even though we were in the majority, we would agree to that offer.”²⁴

Clearly, Bangabandhu’s idea of justice resembles Rawls’s theory of justice. Therefore, in reality, our foundations of justice are not only based on the essence of collective political struggle but are backed by philosophical ideas of justice. The Constitution Drafting Committee was formed on April 11, 1972, and Dr. Kamal Hossain was appointed as the Chairman of the committee by Bangabandhu. Among the prominent members were Barrister Amir-Ul Islam, Advocate Suranjit Sengupta, and Razia Banu, the only female member. Dr. Kamal Hossain wrote:

“During the four decades, people lost power, often through violent interventions, resulting in controversial changes made in the Constitution. We can, however, proudly

23 Rawls, John. (1999). 1. The Role of Justice: Chapter I. Justice As Fairness [Print]. In *A Theory of Justice* (Revised, pp. 3–4). The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press. (Original work published 1971)

24 7th March Speech. (2015). [Print]. In Shamsuzzaman Khan (Ed.), & Fakrul Alam (Trans.), *Bangabandhur Sat-E Marcher Bhashan: Bahumatric Bishlashan (The 7th March Speech: An Extensive Analysis)* (pp. 213–216). Bangla Academy. (Original work published 1971)

say that people steadfastly struggled to uphold the fundamentals of the Constitution, as adopted in 1972. We, thus, have the opportunity today to assess the extent to which the goals of the Constitution have been realized.”²⁵

Kamal Hossain pointed out that the win would ultimately go to people who are the sources of all power. They safeguarded the fundamental principles and rights that they achieved while fighting against so many mighty powers that did not last long. In his profound work, *Making of A Nation Bangladesh: An Economist Tale*, Professor Nurul Islam (1929-2023), the first Deputy Chairman of Bangabandhu’s Planning Commission, artfully captures the sentiments of the early 1950s in East Pakistan. He paints a vivid picture of growing discontentment stemming from a glaring disparity in development and investment between East and West Pakistan. While the western region was experiencing rapid progress in all facets of national life, the eastern region found itself mired in a quagmire of slow development. He explains:

“By the early 1950s, dissatisfaction was building up in East Pakistan about slow development and inadequate investment in contrast to rapid progress in West [Pakistan] in all areas of national life. The unhappiness was fuelled by the fact that the bulk of foreign exchange resources of East [Pakistan] were used for the development of the West. Also, there were great concerns frequently expressed in the press and on the political platform about the persistent and wide gap in the representation of East in all the branches of the policymaking machinery and administration.”²⁶

The disheartening reality further fuelled this discontentment that the major share of East Pakistan’s foreign exchange reserves was siphoned off for developing the western part of the country. Additionally, a prevailing sense of unease echoed through the press. It resonated on political platforms, highlighting the persistent and gaping chasm in East Pakistan’s representation across all branches of the policymaking apparatus and administrative echelons. Nurul Islam astutely underscores how Pakistan’s state policies, less than three years after its separation from the Indian Sub-continent in the latter part of 1947, failed to uphold principles of equity and instead exhibited a discernible bias favouring the western provinces. These injustices imposed upon the Bengalis gave rise to a sotto voce hum of discontent in social interactions, as the material deprivations

25 Hossain, Dr. K. (2020, February). Our constitution, the goals of independence and four decades of experience [Print]. In A. Javed (Ed.), *Bangladesher Sangbidhan: Nana Prosonga* (Bangladesh Constitution and Its Different Aspects) (pp. 57–63). Anyapokash (ISBN: 978 984 502 599 7).

26 Islam (Economist), N. (2013). Chapter 2: Concept of Two Economies: First Encounter with the Pakistani Establishment [Print]. In *Making of A Nation Bangladesh: An Economist Tale* (3rd ed., p. 23). The University Press Limited (UPL). (Original work published 2003)

endured by the populace inevitably left their mark on human behaviour and collective consciousness. Significantly, it's crucial to note that there were no direct water connections between East and West Pakistan, effectively placing them at a staggering distance of approximately 1200 miles apart.

In his book, *From Two Economies to Two Nations: My Journey to Bangladesh*, Professor Rehman Sobhan (1935-), one of the most outspoken members of Bangabandhu's Planning Commission, states:

“The idea of two economies located within the nation-state of Pakistan was conceptualized through the writings of several Bengali economists. ... The indivisibility of the national economy as a postulate may imply one of two things. First, that the economy is indivisible in an organic sense. The term indivisibility, however, has certain forbidding connections which provide ample meat for a philosophical feast. ... we mean that there is one economy in Pakistan and not two. We can then examine the question of whether, in fact, there are one or two economies in Pakistan.”²⁷

In the following table, the ever-growing disparity becomes vibrant

SL No.	Particulars of Disparity	East Pakistan (Bangladesh)	West Pakistan
1.	Government Expenditure	1500 Crore Taka	5000 Crore Taka
2.	Development Expenditure	3000 Crore Taka	6000 Crore Taka
3.	Foreign Aid	20%	80%
4.	Import	25%	75%
5.	Job placements in Central Govt.	15%	85%
6.	Job placement in the Military	10%	90%
7.	Rice/40Kg=1 Mon	50 Taka	25 Taka
8.	Flour/40Kg=1 Mon	30 Taka	15 Taka
9.	Master Oil/Kg	5 Taka	2.50 Taka
10.	Gold/Bhori	170 Taka	135 Taka

Source: *Liberation War Museum*²⁸

27 Sobhan, P. (2016). Part I: Two Economies; 1.1 the Indivisibility of the National Economy of Pakistan [Print]. In *From Two Economies to Two Nations: My Journey to Bangladesh* (2nd ed., pp. 1–3). The Daily Star Books. (Original work published 2014)

28 *The General Election of 1970 Historical Poster of Awami League* (By Liberation War Museum). (1969). [Print]. Gallery-1, Agargaon, Dhaka-1207, Civic Centre, Plot: F11/A & F11/B, Bangladesh.

In summary, the entrenchment of entitlement failures extended to both primary and secondary entitlements. Pakistan's central policymakers conspicuously lacked a genuine commitment to the well-being of their eastern counterpart. Deliberate efforts were made to strip the people of East Pakistan of essential primary goods, and concurrently, they were denied equitable social positions and rights, effectively diminishing both individual and collective freedoms. Ultimately, this culmination of injustices and disparities precipitated the War of Liberation, leading to the fracturing of East Pakistan from the rest of the country and the birth of Bangladesh as a sovereign and independent nation.

References

- Arya, A., Ihle, R., & Heijman, W. (2023). An Analytical Framework for Household Entitlement Assessment in Civil War. *Disasters*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/disa.12579>
- Ahmed, A. F. (2022). Introduction: Bangladesh History and Culture: An Overview [Print]. In A. F. Ahmed, B. M. Chowdhury, A. Khan, A. M. Chowdhury, & S. M. Shahed (Eds.), *An Introductory Reader: Bangladesh National Culture and Heritage*. ISBN 978 984 506 273 2 (2nd ed., pp. 4–5). The University Press Limited (UPL), Dhaka, Bangladesh.
- Ahsan, S. B. (2020, March 4). When Mr Jinnah came to Dhaka. *Dhaka Tribune*. <https://www.dhakatribune.com/opinion/op-ed/202933/when-mr-jinnah-came-to-dhaka>
- Dreze, J., Sen, A. & Hussain, A. (Eds.). (1995). *The Political Economy of Hunger: Selected Essays (WIDER Studies in Development Economics)*. (pp. 52-53). Oxford University Press.
- Dhirendranath Datta's proposal. (2023). In *Bengali Language Movement*. Retrieved September 17, 2023, from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bengali_language_movement
- Gora: Rabindranath Tagore: Free download, Borrow, and streaming: Internet Archive. (1949). Internet Archive. <https://archive.org/details/in.ernet.dli.2015.351175/page/n417/mode/2up?view=theater>
- Hasan Azizul Huq. (2013). Chapter-4. In *Socrates* (p. 59). Ittadi Grantho Prokash.
- Hossain, Dr. K. (2013, December 1). *Bangladesh: Quest for Freedom and Justice*. (pp. 6-9). Oxford University Press, USA.
- Hossain, Dr. K. (2020, February). Our constitution, the goals of independence, and four decades of experience [Print]. In A. Javed (Ed.), *Bangladesher Sangbidhan: Nana Prosonga (Bangladesh Constitution and Its Different Aspects)* (pp. 57–63). Anyaprokash (ISBN: 978 984 502 599 7).
- Islam (Economist), N. (2013). Chapter 2: Concept of Two Economies: First Encounter with the Pakistani Establishment [Print]. In *Making of A Nation Bangladesh: An Economist Tale* (3rd ed., p. 23). The University Press Limited (UPL). (Original work published 2003)
- Lingua. (2022, July 29). How many languages are there in the world? | *Lingua.edu*. [Lingua.edu](https://lingua.edu/how-many-languages-are-there-in-the-world/). <https://lingua.edu/how-many-languages-are-there-in-the-world/>
- Osmani, S. R. (2019, July). Understanding Some Aspects of Poverty and Inequality in Bangladesh during 2010-2016. In Bureau of Economic Research (BER), University of Dhaka (Ed.), *Poverty and Inequality in Bangladesh*. Bureau of Economic Research.
- Rana, K., & Sarkar, M. (March, 2020). *Living World of the Adivasis of West Bengal: An Ethnographic Exploration*. The Asiatic Society, Kolkata and Pratichi Institute, The Pratich (India) Trust. <https://doi.org/10.13140/RG.2.2.35541.78562>

- 7th March Speech. (2015). [Print]. In Shamsuzzaman Khan (Ed.), & Fakrul Alam (Trans.), *Bangabandhur Sat-E Marcher Bhashan: Bahumatrik Bishlashan (The 7th March Speech: An Extensive Analysis)* (pp. 213–216). Bangla Academy. (Original work published 1971)
- Rawls, John. (1999). 1. The Role of Justice: Chapter I. Justice As Fairness [Print]. In *A Theory of Justice* (Revised, p. 3). The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press. (Original work published 1971)
- Sen, A. (1981). *Poverty and Famines: An Essay on Entitlement and Deprivation*. Oxford University Press.
- Sen, A. (1999). Chapter 1: Poverty and Entitlements [Print]. In *Poverty and Famines: An Essay on Entitlement and Deprivation* (pp. 1–8). Oxford University Press (Oxford India Paperbacks). (Original work published 1981)
- Sen, A. (2021, July). The Rivers of Bengal [Print]. In *Home in the World: A Memoir* (p. 25). Allen Lane, an imprint of Penguin Books, Penguin Random House, UK. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00207233.2022.2043117>
- Sichel, B., & Sichel, B. (2019, November 6). Understanding extinct languages: when and why they die off - ILS Translations. ILS Translations - Technical Translation Services. <https://www.ilstranslations.com/blog/understanding-extinct-languages-when-and-why-they-die-off/>
- Sobhan, P. (2016). Part I: Two Economies; 1.1 The Indivisibility of the National Economy of Pakistan [Print]. In *From Two Economies to Two Nations: My Journey to Bangladesh* (2nd ed., pp. 1–3). The Daily Star Books. (Original work published 2014)
- United Nations. (10 December 1948). Universal Declaration of Human Rights | United Nations. <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/universal-declaration-of-human-rights>
- The General Election of 1970 Historical Poster of Awami League (By Liberation War Museum). (1969). [Print]. Gallary-1, Agargaon, Dhaka-1207, Civic Centre, Plot: F11/A & F11/B, Bangladesh.
- Wikipedia contributors. (2023). Bengali language movement. Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bengali_language_movement
- Dhirendranath Datta's proposal. (2023). In Bengali Language Movement. Retrieved September 17, 2023, from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bengali_language_movement